

## ALBEMARLE COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

June 26, 2017: County Office Building, McIntire Rd., Room 241, 4:30 PM

---

### MINUTES

Committee Member Name	Present	Absent
1. Betsy Baten	X	
2. Erika Castillo	X	
3. Ed Lay	X	
4. Jared Loewenstein	X	
6. Crystal Ptacek	X	
7. Liz Russell	X	
8. Ross Stevens	X	
9. Jeff Werner		X
10. Peter Wiley	X	
<b>Liaison Name</b>		
Ann Mallek, BOS	X	
Jennie More, PC	X	
<b>Visitor Name/Contact Information</b>		
Fred Missel, UVA Foundation	X	

1. **Call meeting to order:** J. Werner called the meeting to order at 4:41 PM with a quorum.

#### 2. Announcements

- Next meeting: July 24, 2017, 4:30 PM, room 241 in the County Building

#### 3. Approval of Minutes

- Minutes from April were approved (Motion by Ed Lay, second by Peter Wiley, vote unanimous).

#### 4. Discussion Items

- Birdwood: UVA Indoor Golf Practice Facility-Amendment
  - Fred Missel was introduced as a visitor from The UVA Foundation.
  - Heather McMahon told HPC about the house and property at Birdwood. The house was built between 1819 and 1834 and was owned by William Garth. It was possibly constructed as the same builders as those working at UVA. The house's curtilage includes the main house and four dependencies that are contemporary with the house. The circular water tower to the east is early 20<sup>th</sup> century. A consultant from a Cultural Resource Management firm, AECOM, who prepared *Birdwood Landscape: Site Protection and Stewardship Strategies Plan* in 2015, called this area the "historic core". The "outer precinct" is most significant for its vernacular design with

outbuildings and farm lanes. McMahon said that there may be features that remain below ground. The core and outer precinct are topographically higher than what were the former agricultural area. Other later-dating outbuildings include a brick stable, a framed auto garage, a silo, and two brick ranch tenant houses.

- H. McMahon said that the property is located on 250 West near entrance to the Boar's Head.
- H. McMahon reported that Charles Edgar purchased the property in 1903 and installed a *ferme ornée*, put in a granary, and doubled the size of the main house. Hollis Rinehart, who purchased the property in 1909, added colonial revival detailing inside and also added the water tower. The property was nominated in 2003 for the National Register of Historic Places.
- H. McMahon continued that in 2015, the UVA Foundation applied for a special use permit for the construction of an indoor golfing facility. The Foundation has submitted an amendment with a new driving range. The new facility would directly impact four significant early 20<sup>th</sup>-century structures. The plan is to rehab the carriage house and reuse it as the entrance lobby to the new facility. A new proposed parking lot would bisect the historic core and would alter the relationship between the historic core and the outer precinct and impact the historic cultural setting. H. McMahon asked that HPC discuss the level of impact on historic resources and make a recommendation to the Planning Commission (PC). The PC meeting is scheduled for July 25. The PC will make a recommendation to the Board of Supervisors.
- J. Loewenstein asked if the new facility would be visible from Route 250. H. McMahon replied that using sightline analysis, it will be minimally visible from Ivy Road, and tree screening will shield it further. J. Loewenstein asked if the screening trees would be deciduous. H. McMahon replied that she was unsure what trees are being proposed, and the planting plan is just a concept.
- L. Russell asked if Birdwood was individually listed [on the NRHP]. H. McMahon replied yes and its period of significance ranges between 1819 and 1953.
- P. Wiley asked if the Gillette garden would be unaffected. H. McMahon replied yes. J. Loewenstein said that not much exists of what was originally installed in the garden.
- L. Russell asked if DHR had weighed in. H. McMahon replied no, because the property is privately owned. L. Russell said that there are no federal funds to support further work there.
- F. Missel said that the purposes of HPC and The UVA Foundation are aligned. The Foundation took ownership in 2012 from the University and assumed one property boundary around what the UVA Foundation previously owned and the newly acquired Birdwood. Since they've acquired that parcel, the UVA Foundation has spent close to \$600,000 doing structural improvements to the main building and outbuildings. Missel said that they've engaged the Facilities Management Department at UVA to help with repairs. The Foundation has acted with historical sensitivity. They've undertaken massive cleaning and mowing. They contracted AECOM to produce a historic landscape plan.
- F. Missel said that the Gillette Garden was never actually implemented. He said that last year, a professor at the A-school did GPR and looked at outbuildings and used Birdwood as a learning laboratory.

- F. Missel said that UVA has needed a golf practice facility for nearly twenty years. Both the men's and women's golf teams have gotten really good. In planning a clubhouse, architects need to be aware of prevailing winds and the sun. Missel said that The Virginia Athletics Foundation and UVA Athletics wanted to have a building of significance for the golf teams.
- F. Missel said the Foundation has thought about what viewshed they should focus on from the historic mansion. Two magnolias define the view from the mansion. The Foundation is using Mark Permar, a landscape architect from NC. The Foundation has wondered how the University can restore historic structures. Missel said that they have to run this as a business with a funding source that has to be identified. Their long term plan is to restore the main house.
- L. Russell asked if the Foundation has looked at any other parking alternatives to relegate it more. F. Missel said that the further away the lot is placed from the building, the less safe it is for the student athletes. They've really focused on Golf Course Drive to Ednam. The connection for emergency vehicles only has one access point on 250, so the eventual plan is to create a connector drive between Golf Course Drive and Berwick. The focus on maintaining the bucolic entry/arrival sequence has been foremost in the Foundation's mind. The proposed parking is out of main viewshed and is safe for students.
- B. Baten said she was confused why parking in proximity to a building for safety is an issue. F. Missel replied that lighting is an issue, because if students have to park far away, they will have to walk further. Plus, if spaces are handicap accessible, they must be located closer to the building. E. Lay asked if there was any way to put parking on the other side of the building. F. Missel replied that some folks can hit 300 to 350 yards, and that the distance of the proposed lot is safe. A. Mallek said that neighbors in Bell-Air are too far south to get hit with golf balls.
- F. Missel said that the intent is to make the building look like a barn. The same architects are working on the [UVA] squash complex. L. Russell asked if balls would actually be leaving the building. F. Missel replied yes.
- J. Loewenstein asked if they could reevaluate the parking level, because relatively minimal grading would assist a great deal. R. Stevens asked about the idea of a ha-ha with a hedgerow and asked about the elevation on the house to the car in feet. F. Missel replied about ten feet and up to sixteen or eighteen feet.
- L. Russell asked about adverse effects to the contributing structures. She said that sometimes, additions not looking historic is a good thing. She also noted that the proposed parking lot is in close proximity to the historic core and the contributing farm buildings. R. Stevens asked if the new parking lot surface would be standard asphalt. F. Missel said that the material is to be determined. He replied to L. Russell and said that the addition material would probably be wood sided like board & batten rather than stone, because they don't want it to match too much. J. Loewenstein pointed out that the fenestration design would be worth keeping in mind and asked about keeping the stylistic trait from the older buildings separate. E. Lay asked if the UVA Foundation had thought about a modern building. F. Missel replied that Bartsen and Ball from Richmond is the other architect. He continued that they don't want to be traditional but rather transitional, so they looked to materials. They like the idea of the golf clubhouse looking like a farm building in the natural landscape in keeping with

the history of Birdwood. The idea is to tie back the building to the vernacular. L. Russell asked if The UVA Foundation ever looked into replacing the existing driving range as a facility that could function as both. F. Missel replied yes.

- C. Ptacek asked if any archaeology had been conducted on the property. She said that any grading for a new lot would be detrimental to any historic, unknown outbuildings. F. Missel replied yes, a Phase I survey was completed, and if additional construction takes place, they would do another pass.
- R. Stevens said that lighting would be bad. F. Missel said that this will be the home for UVA golf, and you can't hit golf balls in the dark. He said that there are no plans for big flood lights.
- F. Missel said that they've held four neighborhood meetings and the proposed spot for the building makes the least impact to neighbors. He said that UVA has said they won't hit in the dark.
- Review of demolition statistics by Demolition Subcommittee; what constitutes significance
  - J. Loewenstein said that this item will be held for a future date.
- Committee field trips: Ideas for future trips
  - J. Loewenstein asked for idea submissions. He pointed out it would be helpful for additional property owners to work with the HPC.
- Continuation of historic resource photos on County's website
  - J. Loewenstein said that the County's website will be rebuilt. The HPC used to have a presence on the front page, but in the future version, HPC may not, but that on HPC's own page, we can feature something different on a monthly basis. He said that B. Baten has agreed to take this on.
- Manual for Homeowners: Additional case studies?
  - J. Loewenstein asked for additional ideas and suggestions for case studies for homeowners.
- Preservation Week 2018
  - J. Loewenstein said that in the distant past, HPC has contributed to Preservation Week, but in recent past, HPC has not.
- Birdwood
  - M. Maliszewski pointed out that the Committee did not take a formal action on the Birdwood issue. She asked for recommendations on issues for the Planning Commission to consider. She reiterated that comments were needed by July 7.
  - J. Loewenstein said that the points in contention are the proposed parking and the design of the building itself. L. Russell asked if these changes would compromise the listing of this resource or if the changes put the property at risk. H. McMahon said that DHR hasn't been asked to comment because Birdwood is privately owned. J. Loewenstein said that HPC's concerns include parking, lighting, and the elevation of the building.
  - A. Mallek said that downlights are required. H. McMahon said that there are eleven proposed freestanding poles around the parking lot and access drive with none of the lumens exceeding 3000. She also pointed out that the landscape plan is conceptual. P. Wiley said that lighting can have a bigger impact than the buildings in terms of severing the land.

- J. More said that the Planning Commission doesn't get a huge level of detail in plantings, for instance. The PC moves forward with things that they are told will happen.
- E. Lay asked about the UVA professor who went out to research the landscape. H. McMahon replied she was not sure, but E. Lay suggested Will Rieley. P. Wiley pointed out that it is not HPC's job to pick a location but rather provide comments on the existing spot. J. Loewenstein said that no one has submitted any plans to do anything with the empty mansion which has been sitting empty for decades. P. Wiley said that the parking lot won't matter if the house falls down. L. Russell asked if HPC could ask for more information on why the original site was moved and that the original location seems to have less impact on the historic core. She asked if the view on the entrance road or the historic view from the house was more important.
- M. Maliszewski listed HPC's points:
  - The HPC is concerned that the proposed development will compromise the site's eligibility and current individual listing on the National Register of Historic Places and would like confirmation from the Virginia Department of Historic Resources (VDHR) that it does not.
  - The HPC would like the applicant to provide a detailed explanation of why the previously approved location for the facility was deemed undesirable.
  - The HPC believes the proposed parking area should be relegated outside of the historic core. Preferably, the proposed parking should be relocated adjacent to Golf Course Drive. Should the Planning Commission choose to accept the current location, then the applicant should implement a combination of sensitive site grading and screening through vegetation that will mitigate the parking's visual impact on the historic site.
  - The visual impacts of exterior lighting on the historic site shall be limited.
  - The applicant must exercise due diligence in undertaking thorough archaeological investigation of the entire area proposed for ground disturbance.
- J. Loewenstein put up for a vote forwarding the five points to the Planning Commission prior to the Board of Supervisors. B. Baten moved to accept the motion, and P. Wiley seconded. Vote unanimous.

## 5. Work Group Updates

- Demolition and Documentation
  - R. Stevens looked at the Demolition list. He suggested starting at the bottom of the list in looking for new properties added to the list. He also said he took photos and documented the Crickenberger house.

## 6. Questions

- none

## Other:

- L. Russell said that she joined the AHIP board and will be working with historic preservation and affordable housing.

- B. Baten passed around a picture of a house labeled “Peter Jefferson Farm, Albemarle County” from the 1930s and wondered if anybody knew anything about it.

7. **Adjourn:** The meeting adjourned at 6:18 PM.

DRAFT