

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT

Project #/Name	ARB-2016-155: LL Bean at Stonefield
Review Type	Amendment to a Certificate of Appropriateness and Advisory Review
Parcel Identification	061W00300019A0
Location	2035 Bond Street in the Stonefield Town Center
Zoned	Neighborhood Model District (NMD)/Entrance Corridor (EC)
Owner/Applicant	Albemarle Place EAAP LLC/Bill Tomala
Magisterial District	Jack Jouett
Proposal	The applicant proposes to renovate the exterior of the Blue Ridge Mountain Sports tenant space to accommodate an LL Bean store. The renovation includes the installation of four wall-mounted kayaks on the Rt. 29 building elevation, which constitutes outdoor display and requires a Special Use Permit. The renovation also includes: the removal of the two wall trellises and associated vines on the Rt. 29 building elevation; the painting of columns, trim/flushing, and portions of the stucco bays dark gray; the addition of wooden trellises, built around canopies currently installed over windows and extended along the north and south elevations; the installation of green metal board-and-batten style siding on portions of the north, east and south elevations; the installation of wall lights over the display kayaks, over new wall signs on the north, east and south elevations, and under the wood trellises; and revision of some windows to eliminate transparency. These changes require an amendment to the Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit.
Context	The work is proposed for a prominent corner at the main entrance into the Stonefield Town Center from the Rt. 29 Entrance Corridor. The immediate context is that of the shopping center. A mix of commercial, residential and industrial uses are located nearby.
Visibility	The proposed changes will be readily visible from the Entrance Corridors.
ARB Meeting Date	January 17, 2017
Staff Contact	Margaret Maliszewski

PROJECT HISTORY

The site plan for Phase 1 of the Stonefield development received a Certificate of Appropriateness on December 16, 2011. The tenant space that is the subject of this review was previously occupied by Blue Ridge Mountain Sports.

ANALYSIS

REF	GUIDELINE	ISSUE	RECOMMENDATION
1	The goal of the regulation of the design of development within the designated Entrance Corridors is to insure that new development within the corridors reflects the traditional architecture of the area. Therefore, it is the purpose of ARB review and of these Guidelines, that proposed development within the designated Entrance Corridors reflect elements of design characteristic of the significant historical landmarks, buildings, and structures of the Charlottesville and Albemarle area, and to promote orderly and attractive development within these corridors. Applicants should note that replication of historic structures is neither required nor desired.	The original design of this building (and most of the buildings in the center) was based on a series of bays that were broken down with pilasters, the use of color, and the addition of metal trellises, some intended for growing vines. This proposal would replace the metal trellises on the Rt. 29 Entrance Corridor elevation with wood trellises to which kayaks would be bolted. The metal trellises were intended as architectural features to help relieve blankness. Although the proposed wooden trellises are similar, the addition of kayaks takes the feature out of the architectural realm and moves it into the world of corporate branding and advertising. This proposed display is not appropriate because the kayaks are taking the place of architectural elements on a prominent elevation, and they will diminish the visual cohesiveness of the shopping center rather than enhance the integration of the building with the surrounding land and vegetation along the corridor. Furthermore, this type of display could set an undesirable precedent in which other businesses request similar wall-mounted displays (tires for an auto store, toys for a toy store, paint cans for a paint store). Attaching merchandise to the building diminishes compatibility, cohesiveness and connection to historic architecture.	Move the outdoor display to the Bond Street elevation, just west of the store entrance. Should the ARB choose to recommend approval of the display on the Rt. 29 elevation, staff recommends that the color of the kayaks be limited to one that is significantly more restrained than the one illustrated, and one that is more consistent with the approved building colors.
3	New structures and substantial additions to existing structures should respect the traditions of the architecture of historically significant buildings in the Charlottesville and Albemarle area. Photographs of historic buildings in the area, as well as drawings of architectural features, which provide important examples of this tradition are contained in Appendix A.		Eliminate the green metal siding from the stone wall on the Rt. 29 facing elevation. Should the ARB determine that the green metal siding is acceptable in this location, it is recommended that the size of the metal panel be reduced to maintain the stone as the primary material.
4	The examples contained in Appendix A should be used as a guide for building design: the standard of compatibility with the area's historic structures is not intended to impose a rigid design solution for new development. Replication of the design of the important historic sites in the area is neither intended nor desired. The Guideline's standard of compatibility can be met through building scale, materials, and forms which may be embodied in architecture which is contemporary as well as traditional. The Guidelines allow individuality in design to accommodate varying tastes as well as special functional		

	requirements.		
	Structure design		
2	Visitors to the significant historical sites in the Charlottesville and Albemarle area experience these sites as ensembles of buildings, land, and vegetation. In order to accomplish the integration of buildings, land, and vegetation characteristic of these sites, the Guidelines require attention to four primary factors: compatibility with significant historic sites in the area; the character of the Entrance Corridor; site development and layout; and landscaping.	A more appropriate location for the display is on the Bond Street elevation, just west of the store entrance. The proposed display is more consistent with the treatment of Bond Street elevations where the ARB agreed to reduced oversight on signage and relaxed application of guidelines as visibility is reduced with a narrower view window and with greater distance from the EC. The illustrated neon green color of the kayaks would not be appropriate for the Rt. 29 side of the building, but would be acceptable west of the entrance on Bond Street.	
5	It is also an important objective of the Guidelines to establish a pattern of compatible architectural characteristics throughout the Entrance Corridor in order to achieve unity and coherence. Building designs should demonstrate sensitivity to other nearby structures within the Entrance Corridor. Where a designated corridor is substantially developed, these Guidelines require striking a careful balance between harmonizing new development with the existing character of the corridor and achieving compatibility with the significant historic sites in the area.	None of the proposed changes will increase the compatibility of the existing building with the historic architecture of the area. The changes would, however, increase the connection to the company's branding standard. The changes are also expected to reduce the compatibility of the building with the rest of the shopping center. The dark gray paint is a stark contrast to the white and light gray colors that predominate in the center. The green metal siding is also a dark color that contrasts with the light shades of the surrounding context. However, on the north and south elevations, the metal is contained in a limited area and is either viewed at a sufficient distance or has otherwise reduced visibility such that impacts are mitigated. On the east elevation facing the Rt. 29 Entrance Corridor, the green metal covers a significant amount of stone. Stone is a primary material used to mark the entrances and prominent corners of this development. Covering the stone on the Rt. 29-facing elevation is not	
9	Building forms and features, including roofs, windows, doors, materials, colors and textures should be compatible with the forms and features of the significant historic buildings in the area, exemplified by (but not limited to) the buildings described in Appendix A [of the design guidelines]. The standard of compatibility can be met through scale, materials, and forms which may be embodied in architecture which is contemporary as well as traditional. The replication of important historic sites in Albemarle County is not the objective of these guidelines.		
10	Buildings should relate to their site and the surrounding context of buildings.		
12	Architecture proposed within the Entrance Corridor should use forms, shapes, scale, and materials to create a cohesive whole.		

		appropriate because it reduces the visual cohesiveness of the development to emphasize trademark elements. In addition, the bottom of the metal siding does not align with an architectural element, resulting in an uncoordinated appearance. An alternative might be to incorporate metal panels within some of the stucco bays. The new wood canopies do appear coordinated with the building, its materials and colors.	
11	The overall design of buildings should have human scale. Scale should be integral to the building and site design.	The perceived scale of the building is not expected to change with this proposal.	None.
13	Any appearance of “blankness” resulting from building design should be relieved using design detail or vegetation, or both.	The proposal includes a change to the glass in two windows that fall in the new dressing room area and in the footwear storage area. Those windows would be etched for a frosted appearance to eliminate visibility through the glass. One of the windows faces the EC; one faces the parking lot on the south side. (This location on the south side has been updated since the ARB submittal was distributed.) This change will increase the appearance of blankness in the building. Maintaining clear views through the windows is important, particularly for the EC-facing window. The parking lot-facing window would have less impact.	Revise the design to allow the window on the Rt. 29 facing elevation to remain transparent glass.
16	Window glass in the Entrance Corridors should not be highly tinted or highly reflective. <i>Window glass in the Entrance Corridors should meet the following criteria: Visible light transmittance (VLT) shall not drop below 40%. Visible light reflectance (VLR) shall not exceed 30%. Specifications on the proposed window glass should be submitted with the application for final review.</i>		
14	Arcades, colonnades, or other architectural connecting devices should be used to unify groups of buildings within a development.	The wood canopy will help visually connect the building elevations.	None.
15	Trademark buildings and related features should be modified to meet the requirements of the Guidelines.	This proposal is an effort to adapt corporate branding elements to an existing building.	See other recommendations in this report.
	Accessory structures and equipment		
17	Accessory structures and equipment should be integrated into the overall plan of development and shall, to the extent possible, be compatible with the building designs	No changes to accessory structures or equipment have been illustrated.	Confirm that no changes to accessory structures or equipment are proposed.

	used on the site.		
18	The following should be located to eliminate visibility from the Entrance Corridor street. If, after appropriate siting, these features will still have a negative visual impact on the Entrance Corridor street, screening should be provided to eliminate visibility. a. Loading areas, b. Service areas, c. Refuse areas, d. Storage areas, e. Mechanical equipment, f. Above-ground utilities, and g. Chain link fence, barbed wire, razor wire, and similar security fencing devices.		
19	Screening devices should be compatible with the design of the buildings and surrounding natural vegetation and may consist of: a. Walls, b. Plantings, and c. Fencing.		
20	Surface runoff structures and detention ponds should be designed to fit into the natural topography to avoid the need for screening. When visible from the Entrance Corridor street, these features must be fully integrated into the landscape. They should not have the appearance of engineered features.	No changes to stormwater features are proposed.	None.
21	The following note should be added to the site plan and the architectural plan: "Visibility of all mechanical equipment from the Entrance Corridor shall be eliminated."	The note is needed on the plans.	Add the standard mechanical equipment note to the plans.
	Lighting		
22	Light should be contained on the site and not spill over onto adjacent properties or streets;	Excessive spillover is not indicated on the plans.	None.
23	Light should be shielded, recessed or flush-mounted to eliminate glare. All fixtures with lamps emitting 3000 lumens or more must be full cutoff fixtures.	All proposed fixtures are full cutoff fixtures.	None.
24	Light levels exceeding 30 footcandles are not appropriate for display lots in the Entrance Corridors. Lower light levels will apply to most other uses in the Entrance Corridors.	Illumination levels reach 21.5 fc. For consistency in the ECs, illumination should not exceed 20 fc.	Revise the lighting design to not exceed 20 fc at the ground.
25	Light should have the appearance of white light with a warm soft glow; however, a consistent appearance throughout a site or development is required. Consequently, if existing lamps that emit non-white light are to remain, new lamps may be required to match them.	Two of the proposed fixtures use LED lamps; one uses incandescent lamps. A mix of LED, incandescent and metal halide lamps were approved for the original development.	None.
26	Dark brown, dark bronze, or black are appropriate colors for free-standing pole mounted light fixtures in the	The pendant fixtures have a weathered rust finish, which is expected to appear	None.

	Entrance Corridors.	coordinated with the development. The sconce finish is not identified, but it is a single fixture and is not expected to have significant visual impact.	
27	The height and scale of freestanding, pole-mounted light fixtures should be compatible with the height and scale of the buildings and the sites they are illuminating, and with the use of the site. Typically, the height of freestanding pole-mounted light fixtures in the Entrance Corridors should not exceed 20 feet, including the base. Fixtures that exceed 20 feet in height will typically require additional screening to achieve an appropriate appearance from the Entrance Corridor.	No new pole lights are proposed.	None.
28	In determining the appropriateness of lighting fixtures for the Entrance Corridors, the individual context of the site will be taken into consideration on a case by case basis.	Pendant fixtures are proposed over the wall signs and over the kayak display. Light levels at the display reach 2.7 fc.	None.
29	The following note should be included on the lighting plan: "Each outdoor luminaire equipped with a lamp that emits 3,000 or more initial lumens shall be a full cutoff luminaire and shall be arranged or shielded to reflect light away from adjoining residential districts and away from adjacent roads. The spillover of lighting from luminaires onto public roads and property in residential or rural areas zoning districts shall not exceed one half footcandle."	The note is needed on the plans.	Add the standard lighting note to the plans.
	<i>Guidelines for the Use of Decorative Landscape Lighting</i>	No such lighting is proposed.	None.
7/8/3 2/35/ 37/38	Landscaping	No new landscaping is proposed to be added along the ECs, interior roads, pedestrian ways, or parking areas.	None.
36	Landscaping of buildings and other structures: a. Trees or other vegetation should be planted along the front of long buildings as necessary to soften the appearance of exterior walls. The spacing, size, and type of such trees or vegetation should be determined by the length, height, and blankness of such walls. b. Shrubs should be used to integrate the site, buildings, and other structures; dumpsters, accessory buildings and structures; "drive thru" windows; service areas; and signs. Shrubs should measure at least 24 inches in height.	Vines would be removed from two bays on the EC-facing elevation to accommodate the kayak display.	See recommendations at #2.

6/39/ 40	Development Pattern, Site Grading	No changes to site layout, grading, stormwater or tree preservation are proposed.	None.
	SIGNS	Three signs are proposed. The signs are composed of individual letters with white faces. In 2011 the ARB determined that town center signs facing Bond Street would not be subject to ARB review/approval.	Note that a separate sign application will be needed.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff recommends the following as the primary points of discussion:

1. The appropriateness of kayaks mounted on the Rt. 29 building elevation for display
2. The color of the kayaks on display
3. Repainting portions of the building darker gray
4. Eliminating the transparency of two windows
5. Covering most of the stone on the Rt. 29 elevation with green metal

Regarding the Special Use Permit request:

Staff recommends that the ARB forward the following recommendation to the Planning Commission:

The ARB cannot support the request for the Special Use Permit for outdoor display as illustrated because it does not meet the Entrance Corridor Design Guidelines, in particular #5, 9, 10, and 12. The ARB can support the outdoor display if relocated to the Bond Street elevation, west of the store entrance.

Staff offers the following comments on the proposed architectural changes:

1. Move the outdoor display to the Bond Street elevation, just west of the store entrance. Should the ARB choose to recommend approval of the display on the Rt. 29 elevation, staff recommends that the color of the kayaks be limited to one that is significantly more restrained than the one illustrated, and one that is more consistent with the approved building colors.
2. Add the standard lighting note to the plans. *Each outdoor luminaire equipped with a lamp that emits 3,000 or more initial lumens shall be a full cutoff luminaire and shall be arranged or shielded to reflect light away from adjoining residential districts and away from adjacent roads. The spillover of lighting from luminaires onto public roads and property in residential or rural areas zoning districts shall not exceed one half footcandle.*
3. Revise the lighting design to not exceed 20 fc at the ground.
4. Add the standard mechanical equipment note to the plans: *Visibility of all mechanical equipment from the Entrance Corridor shall be eliminated.*
5. Confirm that no changes to accessory structures or equipment are proposed.
6. Revise the design to allow the window on the Rt. 29 facing elevation to remain transparent glass.
7. Eliminate the green metal siding from the stone wall on the Rt. 29 facing elevation. Should the ARB determine that the green metal siding is acceptable in this location, it is recommended that the size of the metal panel be reduced to maintain the stone as the primary material.
8. Note that a separate sign application will be needed.

TABLE A

This report is based on the following submittal items:

Sheet #	Drawing Name	Drawing Date/Revision Date
-	Architectural Cover Sheet	-
A111	Site Plan (Conceptual Site Plan)	12-02-2016
A311	Floor Plan	12-02-2016
A201	Exterior Elevations	12-02-2016
-	Front Elevation - Color Rendering	12-02-2016
-	Perspective Renderings – Color (11 pages)	12-02-2016
-	Existing Views (Photos - 5 pages)	12-02-2016
-	Comparable Installations (Photos – 5 pages)	12-02-2016
-	Lighting Information (10 pages)	-